

ENCOMPASSING MORE
THAN A DOZEN UNIONIZED
WORKPLACES UNDER
TRIBUNE PUBLISHING

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	2
INTRODUCTION	3
KEY FINDINGS	4
RACIAL & GENDER EQUITY	6
OVERWORKED & UNDERPAID	9
OUR DEMANDS	12
METHODOLOGY	13
APPENDIX	15

Guilds represented in this study:

The Baltimore Sun Guild The Hartford Courant Guild Suburban Chicago Tribune Guild Chesapeake Guild **Design & Production Studio Guild Tidewater Guild** The Daily News Union The Daily Meal Guild The Morning Call Guild **Orlando Sentinel Guild Tribune Content Agency Guild**





























EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Here's our ask:

We're calling on Tribune Publishing to work with the Guild to create a more equitable work environment for all — one that doesn't discriminate on the basis of race or gender — and to take concrete, measurable steps toward increasing diversity and inclusion in all of our workplaces.



Contacts

Tribune Guilds Community Liaison (412) 352-0784 contact@dobettertribune.org

Introduction

Low wages, especially for essential workers, have been at the core of a national debate about labor shortages since the COVID-19 pandemic began. Factor in gender and race, and those disparities are amplified. This is especially evident for media workers, especially at Tribune Publishing.

In the spirit of working to rectify this, NewsGuild members have created and will soon publish a pay equity study encompassing more than a dozen unionized workplaces across the country.

The results, compiled from data including 384 members' wages and based on anonymized data obtained from Tribune and survey responses, show that Tribune does not equitably compensate workers, employees are taking on more work while being denied raises, that collective bargaining has made a positive impact, and much more.

Key Findings

- White members have a higher median pay than nonwhite colleagues, earning about \$4,000 more than Hispanic or Latino members, \$7,500 more than Black members and \$9,000 more than Asian members.
- Median pay for Black women is 22.5% less than that of white men across the company.
- Median pay for women is about \$8,000 less than for male colleagues across the company's unionized worksites.
- Average pay is significantly higher at the Baltimore Sun and New York Daily News, where members have benefited from collective bargaining for decades.
- More than two-thirds of members said they are undercompensated for their work.
- About a third of members said they work unpaid overtime most weeks, and nearly 15% said that happens every week. In some workplaces, more than half of members said they work overtime most weeks.
- Women report they are assigned more work than men and nonwhite members reported they were assigned more work than white colleagues.

PAGE 02 | EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION

NewsGuild members conducted a pay equity study in more than a dozen unionized workplaces that exposed disparities in the earnings of women and media workers of color.

The study of 384 members' wages, based on anonymized data obtained from Tribune by the NewsGuild and survey responses, reveals average pay is significantly higher at the Baltimore Sun and the New York Daily News, where members have benefited from collective bargaining for decades, compared with those that unionized more recently and have not reached contracts.

Members of each union except for the Daily News also responded to questions about workload, work hours and perceptions of pay equity. The responses show that the higher a member's pay, the likelier they are to plan to stay in their job, demonstrating that fair pay reduces turnover and helps retain experienced and knowledgeable workers.

Of the 384 Guild members asked to take a survey on pay and working conditions, about 73% responded. The participation varied by workplace, but a majority at each responded, and responses from each job classification roughly matched the makeup of the workplaces.

The NewsGuild executed the study to identify bargaining targets and to identify areas in which Tribune can make improvements that would demonstrate its expressed commitment to race and gender equity.



KEY FINDINGS

- Median pay for Black women is 22.5% less than that of white men across the company.
- Median pay for women is about **\$8,355 less** than for male colleagues across the company's unionized workplaces. (See Table 1.)
- Although women on average have eight fewer years of service than
 men, the gender pay gap is apparent when comparing members
 with similar tenure and is generally most pronounced among
 employees hired in the last 10 years. The pay gap is less apparent when
 controlled for overall work experience. (See Table 2.)
- White members have a higher median pay than nonwhite colleagues, earning about \$4,530 more than Hispanic or Latino members, \$7,740 more than Black members and \$7,510 more than Asian members. (See Table 3.)
- About 80% of full-time employees included in the study are white.
 On average, white members have more experience, but there are too few employees of color to make comparisons controlled for service or experience. (See Table 4.)
- More than two-thirds of members said they are undercompensated for their work. (See Table 6.)

KEY FINDINGS

- Women were **more likely** to say they are underpaid. (See Table 7.)
- About a third of members said they work unpaid overtime most weeks and nearly 15% said that happens every week. (See Table 8.)
- In some workplaces, **more than one-third of members** said they work overtime most weeks. (See Table 9.)
- Nearly a quarter of members said they regularly have trouble completing all of the work that is assigned to them in a 40-hour week. (See Table 10.)
- Women reported they are assigned more work than men. (See Table 11.)
- Nonwhite members reported they are assigned more work than white colleagues. (See Table 12.)
- More than a third of members believe they are affected by a pay disparity in their workplace. (See Table 13.)
- Around **20% of members**, including full-time and part-time employees, said they've worked a second job in the last two years. (See Table 14.)
- Pay is stagnant among members hired by Tribune, with most surveyed responding that they have not received a raise since 2019 or earlier. (See Table 15.)
- Men and white members were more likely to have received a raise, but
 88% of members said they haven't seen a raise in years, even though a majority have asked for one. (See Tables 15 and 16.)
- The average pay of people who said they intend to stay with the
 company for the foreseeable future or retire in their current job was
 significantly higher than those who did not, though those members
 also had greater tenure. (See Table 17.)

EMPTY SENTIMENTS ON EQUITY & INCLUSION

This analysis shows Tribune's commitment to racial and gender equity is lacking even as it espouses the importance of diversity in our workplaces and in our coverage of our communities. Tribune has for years allowed compensation disparities between white and BIPOC media workers, as well as men and women in all of our workplaces across the country. We believe that Tribune's effort to recognize the viewpoints of all of its employees and community stakeholders is admirable, but it is an empty gesture when it continues to allow quantifiable inequalities to exist between its members.

The company launched a diversity and inclusion initiative in 2018, acknowledging that it is an "integral business strategy" for improving the way it recruits and retains talent, builds audiences and increases revenue. It brought together leaders throughout the company to design a diversity recruitment strategy.

It also started a series of monthly communications on diversity and inclusion, and established employee resource groups for employees of color, LGBTQ+ employees and women to discuss and confront issues relevant to them in the workplace.

After the murders of George Floyd and Ahmaud Arbery and killing of Breonna Taylor in 2020 sparked nationwide protests highlighting racism, police brutality and the need for equality, Tribune employees received emails from then-Chief Executive Officer Terry Jimenez acknowledging the pain many, particularly Black employees, were feeling. In Guild-led efforts, many workplaces formed local committees to address issues of racial equity in our coverage of the news.

Through all of this, Tribune has paid women and media workers of color thousands less on average than their white male colleagues.

That summer, while many of the company's media workers were furloughed, the company also placed full-page ads stating that "the issues of race, police brutality and equality will continue to be at the forefront of our minds and our coverage."

In August 2020, employees received an email from Vice President of Human Resources Jean Nechvatal marking Women's Equality Day, encouraging them to learn more about the work of activists including Susan B. Anthony, Elizabeth Cady Stanton, Ida B. Wells-Barnett, Harriet Tubman and Mary Church Terrell in the fight for suffrage.

In fall 2020, the company required employees to attend mandatory diversity and inclusion training on the awareness and prevention of unconscious bias and fostering an inclusive work environment.

Other nods to diversity included emails marking National Hispanic Heritage Month and offering support for Asian American and Pacific Islander employees as violence against members of those groups spiked and panel discussions on best practices for ensuring diverse coverage and about the racial reckoning following Floyd's murder.

EMPTY SENTIMENTS ON EQUITY & INCLUSION

In contract bargaining for the majority of TNG/CWA units represented in this study, the Guild asked Tribune to commit to take action to improve diversity and show its work.

The Guild asked Tribune to agree to report annually on its performance in hiring and retaining diverse employees and annually complete the American Society of News Editors report on diversity in the newsroom.

We also asked Tribune to actively recruit from underrepresented groups such as people of African American and Hispanic descent, Native Americans, Alaska Natives and women for all union-eligible positions. We asked the company to commit to a goal of having 35% of its workforce made up of people from minority groups.

To accomplish this, we've asked Tribune to agree to recruit minority candidates by posting job and internship opportunities on the websites of the National Association of Black Journalists, National Association of Hispanic Journalists, Native American Journalists Association, Asian American Journalists Association, Association of LGBTQ Journalists, The Maynard Institute and the Journalism Diversity Project.

We've asked Tribune to strive to build relationships to recruit alumni of historically Black colleges and universities and other institutions with minorities well-represented in the student body.

And the Guild has asked Tribune to agree to have workplace managers meet with union members on a regular basis to discuss diversity and inclusion in each workplace.

The company tentatively agreed to meet with union members to talk about diversity in its workplaces but would only commit that recommendations developed in these meetings would be "considered by newsroom management" while refusing any measurable goals.

Likewise, company bargainers refused to agree to recruit from organizations representing BIPOC journalists, instead allowing only that management would "look for appropriate opportunities to encourage employees from traditionally underrepresented groups" to apply for workplace bargaining unit positions.

In a cynical attempt to flip the script, a company representative repeatedly told one bargaining committee that the Guild's commitment to fair and orderly reductions in force, requiring layoffs in reverse order of seniority, is an anti-diversity policy. By requiring the company to lay off its newest employees first, it would harm the company's efforts to improve diversity, the representative said, ignoring the fact that these deficits have existed for decades.

Tribune's response to each of these proposals?

Not interested.

OVERWORKED & UNDERPAID

Since 2018, Tribune has carried out **round after round** of buyouts, reducing workplaces that were already shadows of their former selves to skeleton crews. Guild members have felt the pinch as they strive to cover essential news for their communities.

As part of the survey of members' working conditions, we asked people to describe how their jobs have changed as Tribune drastically reduced its overall workforce. These are some of the responses:

"I'm taking up more responsibilities that were previously done by people who left and their spots never filled, plus the duties I was doing before they left." — Jacqui Wedewer, former Daily Meal Guild member

"I first asked for a raise in 2019 when I was given more areas to cover. I was told that although my beat was now larger, I wasn't actually expected to work more and therefore I didn't qualify for a raise. I was also told the new union meant no raises could be given now. When I questioned a male colleague recently being promoted and getting a raise they said that was a separate issue. In February 2020 I was promoted to a role previously held by a senior reporter. I was told the company was working on a title change and pay raise, but I didn't receive the promotion until more than a year later in May 2021."

— Christina Tatu, former Morning Call Guild member

OVERWORKED & UNDERPAID

"I went six-and-a-half years between pay increases ... I cannot overstate how extremely demoralizing it was to be repeatedly turned down for even a modest raise when I continued to improve in my work and pick up new skills. A normal person would not stand for this type of treatment. I fully believe that management takes advantage of the fact that journalists like me are so passionate about their work that we'll put up with this."

— Pamela Wood, former Baltimore Sun Guild

"In October 2019, I was told I was on track for a raise, but my bosses wanted to give it a few more months to make certain my work was consistently excellent. I was invited to revisit it in early 2020. When I did, it was shortly after Alden became the majority shareholder and buyouts were being offered and I was told no one was getting a raise. When I asked again last fall, I was told simply 'no.' After nine years of no raises, and a permanent 2% pay cut on top of one week's furlough in 2020, my paycheck had become too small to cover my monthly expenses. I had to go on the federal government's mortgage forbearance program for six months in 2020 and cease making mortgage payments altogether while I arranged for a low-interest refinance."

— Mary Carole McCauley, Baltimore Sun Guild

OVERWORKED & UNDERPAID

We asked our members what else was on their minds, and it's clear many are aware of the pay inequities that exist in our workplaces.

These are some of the responses:

"It seems pretty obvious that the younger you are, the more likely you are to be underpaid. And this needs to be addressed."

Wendy Fox Weber, Suburban Chicago Tribune Guild "I have made it a point to work only 40 hours a week."

— Suzanne Baker, Suburban Chicago Tribune Guild

"The staffing level and the lack of a newsroom are both crippling."

— Jesse Leavenworth, Hartford Courant Guild

"My pay has not kept up with the cost of living. My hourly wage has risen less than \$4 per hour in 16 years of full-time work."

— Dylan Slagle, Chesapeake News Guild "I believe the pay grades should reflect the increases in costs of living, especially in places like Orlando, where the cost of living is rising rapidly. My rent increased last year to nearly half of my take-home pay."

— Katie Rice, Orlando Sentinel Guild

"Several times in my three-and-a-half years working in Tribune Publishing, I've become aware that I, a man, am paid more than women with similar experiences working in near-identical roles. In these instances I have tried to help my female colleagues bargain for equal pay, but that shouldn't be part of my job and definitely shouldn't be part of theirs. Tribune should pay all its employees fairly. We shouldn't even have to ask."

— Alex Putterman, Hartford Courant Guild

OUR DEMANDS

We're calling on Tribune to create a more equitable work environment for all — one that doesn't discriminate on the basis of race or gender.

We ask the company to take concrete and measurable steps to address the lack of diversity in our workplaces and make good on its talk about its commitment to diversity and inclusion. These include tracking and reporting on the state of diversity at its workplaces, concerted efforts to recruit and hire diverse candidates and working with Guild members on issues of diversity and inclusion at each workplace.

We also expect that when the subject of wages is on the bargaining table, Tribune will bargain in good faith and accept the Guild's proposals for a pay scale that puts all unionized employees on equal footing with regard to the type of work they do and their experience in their fields.

HOW WE CREATED THIS REPORT

This study combines both pay data provided by Tribune Publishing and a survey of members conducted in more than a dozen unionized workplaces across the company. The Chicago Tribune is the only unionized newsroom not represented in the data.

We obtained data for 384 employees represented by units through information requests to the company by individual units. Because this study is focused specifically on full-time editorial employees, most of the pay data represented in this study does not include part-time or non-editorial employees.

Most of the data is current as of March 1, 2021, to include raises, hires and separations before Alden Global Capital acquired the company, and it doesn't represent the most recent round of buyouts in June 2021. Individual units updated their most recent information requests from the company with raises and separations their units had been informed of. One full-time editorial employee whose unit did not have salary information for yet is not included.

Each unit was responsible for handling raw pay data. Survey responses were compiled by a handful of members of the joint unit task force, and individual units were given access to survey responses by their members. Units determined their own data handling processes to manually merge the two data sets.

No file with names and salaries for all units exists, and no names attached to salaries were shared beyond units. Units provided an anonymized data file to the joint team, which was handled by former Tidewater Guild member Matt Jones and Morning Call Guild member Peter Hall, along with NewsGuild staff members Malcolm Emerich and Hil O'Connell, who were the only people with access and who joined them into a cross-unit anonymized file and analyzed data. Pay data was analyzed using Google Sheets and JASP open-source statistical software.

HOW WE CREATED THIS REPORT

For full-time employees, pay data was annualized assuming a 2,080-hour work year. Because job titles varied greatly between units, employees were grouped into five broad categories (editorial assistant, non-editorial, production/web, reporter and visual journalist) by representatives of individual units based on their knowledge of their co-workers' job responsibilities.

About 73% of members represented by the joint units filled out the survey. We believe the results of the survey to fairly and accurately reflect the situation of the workplaces at large. A majority of Guild-represented employees in every workplace filled out the survey.

This is reflected in the demographics of survey respondents as well. About 45% of respondents were women, compared to 42% of the workplaces. About 81% were white, compared to 78% of the workplaces. About 50% were categorized as reporters, compared to 46% of the workplaces.

Individual unit data files were shared via email with Jones, who used Excel to combine and standardize the files. Full-time editorial pay data was additionally analyzed using Google Sheets.

1. Median full-time editorial employee pay by gender¹, average experience in journalism²

Gender	Median yearly pay	Years of experience in journalism/media (rounded to nearest whole number)		Breakdown of employees
Female	\$47,347.60		13.7	40.6%
Male	\$55,702.40		21.6	58.9%
Other	\$44,252.00		9.5	0.5%
Grand total	\$52,998.40		18.1	100%

2. Median full-time employee pay by experience in journalism/media and gender

Total years of experience in journalism/media (rounded to nearest whole number)	Female median yearly pay	Male median yearly pay	Grand total
0-4	\$42,016.00	\$40,310.40	\$40,508.00
5-9	\$46,508.80	\$47,507.20	\$47,008.00
10-14	\$49,000.02	\$47,819.20	\$47,992.80
15-20	\$48,006.40	\$55,993.60	\$54,999.98
> 20	\$64,750.40	\$61,199.63	\$62,215.12
Grand total	\$47,008.00	\$54,999.78	\$51,001.60

3. Median full-time editorial employee pay by race, average experience in journalism

Race	Median yearly pay	Average total years of experience in journalism/media (rounded to nearest whole number)		Percent of employees with data
Asian	\$46,485.92		16.0	2.6%
Black	\$46,259.20		13.9	8.1%
Hispanic or Latino Other ³	\$49,462.40		15.2	7.6%
White	\$53,996.80		18.9	80.4%
Grand total	\$51,001.60		18.0	100%

¹ Gender is based on results of a member survey of full- and part-time employees that received 384 responses across the more than a dozen unionized workplaces represented in the pay study. For members who did not respond, gender was either from company data or reported by other members. Two members did not identify themselves as either male or female and are excluded to protect privacy.

³ Results suppressed to protect privacy.

² Experience is based on results of the member survey. For members who did not respond, experience was estimated by other members of their unit based on conversations or publicly available biographical information. Units did not report estimated experience for 35 employees

Race	Percentage of responses	Percentage of employees
Asian	3%	2%
Black	8%	11%
Hispanic or Latino	8%	7%
Other	1%	1%
White	80%	78%
Grand total	100%	100%

³ Results suppressed to protect privacy.

5. Median full-time editorial pay by years with company as of March 1, 2021

Years with company	Median yearly pay	Number of employees
0-1	\$46,009.60	72
2-3	\$47,008.00	79
4-5	\$47,985.60	49
6-7	\$54,999.89	30
8-10	\$60,000.00	31
>10	\$65,062.40	111
Grand total	\$52,998.40	372

6. Do you feel your pay adequately reflects the work you're doing?4

Responses	Percentage of responses
Pay adequately reflects work	9.49%
Pay somewhat reflects work	23.05%
Pay undercompensates work	67.46%
Grand total	100%

7. Do you feel your pay adequately reflects the work you're doing, by gender⁵

Gender	Pay adequately reflects work	Pay somewhat reflects work	Pay undercompensates work
Female	7.52%	18.05%	74.44%
Male	11.25%	27.50%	61.25%
Grand total	9.49%	23.05%	67.46%

8. How often do you work more than 40 hours a week?6

Responses	Percentage of responses
A few times each quarter	38.64%
Every week	14.92%
I never have	5.42%
Most weeks	31.86%
Once or twice a year	9.15%
Grand total	100%

⁴ Daily News Guild data not available.

⁵ Daily News Guild data not available; survey responses from members who didn't identify as men or women suppressed to protect anonymity.

9. How often do you work more than 40 hours a week, by unit⁷

Unit	A few times each quarter	Every week	I never have	Most weeks	Once or twice a year
Baltimore Sun Guild	43%	17%	4%	28%	9%
Chesapeake News Guild	35%	9%	22%	26%	9%
Chicago Suburbs	29%	14%	7%	36%	14%
Daily Meal Guild	25%	0%	25%	25%	25%
Design Production Studio Guild	51%	8%	0%	33%	8%
Hartford Courant Guild	34%	34%	3%	28%	0%
Morning Call Guild	47%	17%	3%	30%	3%
Orlando Sentinel Guild	26%	6%	3%	58%	6%
Tidewater Media Guild	45%	8%	5%	33%	10%
Tribune Content Guild	20%	28%	8%	16%	28%
Grand total	39%	15%	5%	32%	9%

⁶ Daily News Guild data not available.

10. Is it hard to do the work that your boss expects you to do in 40 hours a week?8

Responses	Percentage of responses
Never	17.63%
Regularly	23.39%
Sometimes	58.98%
Grand total	100%

⁸ Daily News Guild data not available.

⁷ Daily News Guild data not available.

11. How many hours do you believe you would need to work in an average week to complete all the work assigned to you, by gender⁹

Gender	Responses (in hours)
Female	44.69
Male	43.32
Grand total	43.96

12. How many hours do you believe you would need to work in an average week to complete all the work assigned to you, by race¹⁰

Race	Responses (in hours)
Asian	44.38
Black	44
Hispanic or Latino	45.48
Other ¹¹	38.25
White	43.89
Grand total	43.96

⁹ Daily News Guild data not available.

¹⁰ Daily News Guild data not available.

¹¹ A large portion of this demographic group are part-time employees, which is why the number is less than 40.

13. Do you feel you are affected by a wage gap or disparity in your newsroom?12

Responses	Percentage of responses		
No	18.46%		
Not sure	43.96%		
Yes	37.58%		
Grand total	100%		

14. Do you or have you worked a second job at any point since Jan. 1, 2019 (for full-time employees hired before March 1, 2019)? 13

Responses	Percentage of responses		
No	80.46%		
Yes	19.54%		
Grand total	100%		

15. Have you gotten a raise since Jan. 1, 2019, by gender14

Gender	No	Yes, after I asked for one	Yes, after I used another job offer to negotiate	Yes, but I didn't ask for one	Yes, but I didn't ask for one, No
Female	90.23%	5.26%	0.00%	4.51%	0.00%
Male	86.88%	4.38%	1.25%	6.88%	0.63%
Grand total	88.14%	4.75%	1.02%	5.76%	0.34%

- Men are more likely than women to have gotten a raise.
- · Across the units, 88% of employees haven't seen a raise in years.

¹² Daily News Guild data not available.

¹³ Daily News Guild data not available.

Daily News Guild data not available.

16. Have you gotten a raise since Jan. 1, 2019, by race15

Race	No	Yes, after I asked for one	Yes, after I used another job offer to negotiate	Yes, but I didn't ask for one	Yes, but I didn't ask for one, No
Asian	87.50%	0.00%	0.00%	12.50%	0.00%
Black	85.00%	5.00%	0.00%	10.00%	0.00%
Hispanic or Latino	83.33%	4.17%	0.00%	12.50%	0.00%
Other ¹⁶					
White	89.12%	4.60%	1.26%	4.60%	0.42%
Grand total	88.14%	4.75%	1.02%	5.76%	0.34%

17. How long do you plan to stay in your newsroom, average pay¹⁷

Responses	Average of yearly pay
A year or two	\$47,765.16
For the foreseeable future	\$54,468.40
I hope to retire here	\$61,479.10
I'm actively seeking other opportunities	\$48,564.66
It depends on what other opportunities I encounter	\$49,976.94
Did not respond	\$53,049.37
Grand total	\$52,332.69

Daily News Guild data not available. Besults suppressed to protect privacy.

¹⁷ Daily News Guild data not available

